

FM REVIEW 2016 23 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: I want to bring to your attention one issue for consideration regarding this beautiful essay. It is about 1590 words in length, so over 50% longer than the upper limit of the narrative essay section. Normally, I would simply say "shorten it!" but this is John Frey, and the essay unspools in a lovely anecdotal way. In my suggested letter to the author, I recommend his trying to make further reductions (the essay is labeled "short version" so presumably he's already cut down the word count once).

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR:

Thank you for this essay. It is a beautifully written meditation on the gifts that patients give their physicians, both concrete and otherwise. It will make a wonderful contribution to the journal. There are two rather minor issues that need to be addressed:

1) The essay significantly exceeds the upper length limit of the narrative essay (1000). We note that the submission is labeled "short version," from which we infer that this represents an already reduced version. While we do not wish to hold you slavishly to a word limit, we hope you might consider ways of editing the piece to reduce the word count still further, so that it is more in line with the section's parameters.

2) Both reviewers noted that, while most gifts are beneficent, occasionally they can exercise a malignant effect on the doctor-patient relationship. We ask that you briefly acknowledge this point, which should provide added depth and complexity to an already outstanding essay. We realize that these are contradictory suggestions - shorten the essay while adding more material - but hope you can accomplish both. Please see suggestions in the attached file.

COMMENTS TO EDITOR II: The author has successfully addressed the two concerns of reviewers and asst editor: 1) The essay now acknowledges that gifts may express other less benevolent motivations than gratitude, while making a good case for assuming beneficence in gift-giving and adopting an attitude of unconditional regard toward patients 2) The word count was reduced from almost 1600 to 1330 words. I am attaching a lightly edited version which reduces the word count to 1300 words and corrects some minor typographical and stylistic issues. I recommend publication contingent on acceptance of these small changes.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR II: Thank you for addressing the two main concerns of reviewers and asst editor: 1) acknowledging that gifts may express other less benevolent motivations than gratitude, while making a compelling moral case for assuming beneficence in gift-giving and adopting an attitude of unconditional regard toward patients 2) Reducing the word count 1330 words, making the essay more well-defined and concentrated while successfully preserving its warm narrative tone. I am attaching a lightly edited version which reduces the word count to 1300 words (although this was not my primary goal) and addresses a few minor typographical and stylistic issues.

Thank you again for a beautifully crafted, lyrical example of storytelling that speaks to the deep meaning of family practice.

COMMENTS TO EDITOR III:\ The author submitted a note approving the editor's recommended edits. Although this version of the essay still exceeds the word limit, it is really a lovely piece and its expansiveness is part of its charm. I suggest we accept as is.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR III: I apologize for the difficulties in viewing the edited version. You are correct that the words and phrases in red represented the suggested edits. Thank you for approving these minor revisions. This is really a charming piece that, through its narrative, offers readers profound insights into the heart of family medicine.